



UNITED NATIONS  
ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA

**Developing supplementary targets and indicators  
to strengthen social inclusion, gender equality  
and health promotion in the Millennium  
Development Goals**

**Draft Synthesis Report**

7-9 May 2008

Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

## **1. Objectives of the meeting**

Objectives of the meeting included the following:

- A. Critically review the draft report and make suggestions to improve the draft document;
- B. Identify key issues, in the selected thematic areas of social exclusion suggest, prioritise and recommend supplementary MDG targets and indicators that can help foster the monitoring of the inclusion of the marginalized groups, gender equality and health equity into mainstream development; and
- C. Identify constraints and opportunities faced by countries in adopting these suggested additional indicators.

The key messages and recommendations that emerged from the experts are organized according to the objectives of the meeting and are presented in the sections that follow.

## **2. Comments to improve the draft report**

The specific comments to improve the draft report that were suggested by the meeting include the following:

1. Report should accurately reflect on the definition of social exclusion in the African context and the causes of social exclusion.
2. The group consisting of the elderly, persons with disabilities and people living with HIV/AIDS be spilt up to ensure these groups are not excluded;
3. Additional socially excluded groups should also be considered such as ethnic groups e.g. nomads, pygmies, and children.
4. A box on the definition of disability can be included.
5. A life-cycle approach can be used to capture the transitions from one stage to another.
6. A discussion on the legal and institutional issues behind social exclusion and how much effort has been made to address it should be added to the report. A discussion is also needed on the weak capacity and the lack of resources for ministries, and overall, how social exclusion is considered in the planning and budgetary processes.
7. Other issues to consider in the report include access to information, vulnerability to poverty, and the social protection frameworks being developed in many African countries; for example, in Ghana, Nigeria, Malawi, Tanzania, Chad, Mozambique, South Africa, Mali, Tunisia and others. Need to discuss the importance of mainstreaming social inclusion in the national development plans and PRSPs. Highlight major challenges facing the implementation of the well developed social protection plans and strategies.
8. The report should make more reference to the regional and international policy frameworks that address social exclusion such as: AU Policy

Framework and Plan of Action on Ageing 2002; UN Madrid International Plan of Action on Ageing 2002; and Livingstone Call for Action: Social Protection 2006.

9. It was also recommended that malaria be given more attention in the report given that it is one of the main killers in Africa.
10. Discussion of the major challenges that countries currently face in monitoring social inclusion in the current MDG indicators.
11. Disaggregation – Participants agreed that all existing MDG indicators need to be disaggregated based on gender, age, locality (rural-urban), type of household, and social groups.
12. Reference to country case studies to strengthen the report in terms of the forms of social exclusion experienced, and the rich initiatives being undertaken (ranging from Specialised funding, universal education, skills training, social transfer programmes etc.)

### **3. Key issues, in the selected thematic areas of social exclusion and suggested and prioritised supplementary MDG targets**

#### **3.1 Promotion of Gender equality in the MDGs**

##### **Key issues**

##### **Negative traditions and culture**

- Affects reproductive rights and women's human rights, e.g. harmful traditional practices (FGM, widow inheritance, widowhood rites, early marriages)
- Taboos on food

##### **Patriarchy**

- Patrilineal and matrilineal systems, which defines status that creates exclusion from property rights and decision-making.
- Unequal power relations between men and women
- This affects inheritance patterns. Men are given preference over immovable property.
- Affects access to land
- Influences traditional and modern governance structures.
- Son preference
- Discriminatory attitudes towards females throughout their life cycle
- Male dominance

##### **Political**

- Political and social structures are not favorable for effective female participation.
- Limited participation of women to elective and non-elective posts (traditional and modern)

## Social

- Access to basic services (education, health, sexual and reproductive health).
- Gender-based violence
- Inadequate/discriminatory/un-enforced laws and lack of knowledge of laws

## Economic

- Income inequalities at all levels
- Unpaid work of women (domestic, reproductive, care and support)
- Limited access to the means of production (credit, land)
- Unemployment and limited access to higher paying jobs

## Suggested indicators

Existing indicators should be disaggregated by sex, age, locality, type of household and social groups. Suggested additional indicators are presented in table 3.1.

**Table 3.1 Supplementary indicators to promote of gender equality in the MDGs**

Goal	Additional Indicator
<b>Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• % population in poverty in the informal and formal sector, by sex and occupation</li> <li>• Share of unpaid work between women and men</li> <li>• % increase in local food production</li> </ul>
<b>Additional target:</b> Achieve full access for women to agricultural inputs and markets	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Proportion of the population who own land (under both statutory and customary laws), by sex</li> <li>• Access to extension services, by sex</li> <li>• Access to agricultural credit, by sex</li> <li>• Access to technology, by sex</li> <li>• Access to agricultural markets, by sex</li> </ul>
<b>Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• % of children registered at birth by sex and locality</li> </ul>
<b>Goal 3: Promote gender equality and empower women</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• % of women in parliament and local governance</li> <li>• % of women in decision making in private and public organizations</li> <li>• Incidence of gender based violence per 100,000 women/year</li> <li>• % of GBV perpetrators convicted</li> <li>• Incidence of FGM and early marriage, by age</li> </ul>
<b>Goal 5: Improve maternal health</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Percentage of female population within 2 hours travel distance of basic emergency obstetric care</li> <li>• Proportion of women in the reproductive age (15-45) who have access to prenatal care at the primary health care level</li> <li>• Proportion of population in the reproductive age (15-45) who have full</li> </ul>

	<p>access to reproductive health services at the primary health care level, by sex</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Prevalence of contraceptive use, by sex</li> <li>• Age at marriage, by sex</li> <li>• Child bearing among girls aged 15-19 years</li> <li>• Proportion of pregnant women who are anaemic</li> </ul>
<b>Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and other Diseases</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Proportion of population with access to preventive and treatment medication, by sex</li> </ul>

### **Recommendations:**

Introduce a new target under Goal 3 (or change the title of Goal 3) to be *Eliminate Violence Against Women and Girls and Promote Equal Participation of Women in Decision Making*. This target (or goal) should be focussed on women's human rights issues such as violence against women and political participation.

## **3.2 Promotion of social inclusion of youth in the MDGs**

### **Key issues**

#### **Exclusion from the Labour market**

- Lack of employable skills – mismatch between training received and labour demand; racial discrimination in access to marketable skills
- Slow economic growth with limited absorption of the youth
- Mistrust of the youth, e.g. lack of work experience
- National definition of Youth as prescribed by legislation – statutory age for employment; 18, 16 in others work

#### **Exclusion from decision-making**

- Lack of information on decision-making spaces
- Illiteracy
- Limited representation of young people in socio-economic and political processes

#### **Exclusion from social participation**

- Physical and intellectual disabilities, depression, suicidal tendencies, hopelessness
- Increased school drop out, poverty level, child abuse, abortion;
- Teenage mothers
- Crime and drugs: youth involved in substance abuse; young offenders; young victims and survivors of violence and crime; young people involved in gangs; young people from dysfunctional families
- Homeless young adults surviving on the streets
- Young people living with HIV and AIDS
- Youth headed households
- FGM

- Limited access to sexual and reproductive health
- Limited access to ICT by the rural youth
- Majority of slum dwellers are young people

**Exclusion of Vulnerable children**

- Lack of registration of children
- Breakdown of family and other social support structures
- “Streetism”, child trafficking, child labour
- Child prostitution, child poverty, children in conflict with the law
- Orphans and child headed households

Table 3.2 shows the suggested supplementary indicators.

**Table 3.2 Suggested supplementary indicators to promote the social inclusion of youth**

<b><i>Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</i></b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Youth unemployment rate</li> <li>▪ % of young people without contracts in the labour market</li> <li>▪ Proportion of youth enrolled in vocational and technical training institutions</li> <li>▪ Proportion of the youth population who have been able to set up their own businesses</li> </ul>
<b><i>Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education</i></b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ % of children registered at birth</li> </ul>
<b><i>Goal 5: Improve maternal health</i></b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Percentage of adolescent pregnancies (young women aged 15-19)</li> <li>▪ Percentage of young women with access to prenatal and reproductive health services</li> </ul>
<b><i>Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and other Diseases</i></b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Proportion of children and youth with HIV/AIDS with access to ART</li> </ul>
<b><i>MDG 8: Develop a global partnership for development</i></b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Proportion of young people with access to telephone, cellular and Internet services</li> <li>▪ Proportion of HIPC relief going to youth</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Proportion of youth representation in parliament; local councils</li> </ul>

**3.3 Promotion of social inclusion of older people, persons with disability and PLWHA in the MDGs**

Additional socially excluded groups include orphans and vulnerable children; ethnic minorities; commercial sex workers; street beggars; and internally displaced people.

### Key social exclusion issues

- Lack of full participation in economic life: restricted access to earn income and livelihood opportunities; labour constraints; lack of social protection; discrimination and stigma; high poverty.
- Exclusion from social participation: restricted access to social services, social security, community and family support; discrimination and stigma; impact of HIV/AIDS the resulting care giver role especially for older women; limited access to specialised services; lack of social networks; limited access to education; lack of prioritised support to alleviate poverty of these excluded groups in poverty reduction strategies.
- Exclusion from political and community participation: restricted access to consultation, decision-making, community organisations.
- Poverty is a major contributing factor to all the dimensions of social exclusion of older persons.

**Table 3.3 Suggested supplementary indicators to promote the social inclusion of persons with disabilities, older persons, PLWHA, OVCs**

	<b>Additional Indicator</b>
<b><i>Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</i></b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Percentage of older people/PWD-headed households living in extreme poverty</li> <li>▪ Percentage of older persons/PWD/PLWHA/OVCs suffering from hunger</li> <li>▪ Proportion of older persons/PWD/PLWHA/OVCs who have access to social protection</li> <li>▪ Proportion of older persons/PWD/PLWHA/OVCs who have access to poverty reduction programmes</li> <li>▪ Proportion of PWD in formal sector employment</li> <li>▪ Share of older women/women with disabilities in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector</li> </ul>
<b><i>Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education</i></b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Net enrolment ratio in primary and secondary education of children with disabilities and OVCs.</li> <li>▪ Ratio of school attendance of orphans to school attendance of non-orphans disaggregated by sex</li> <li>▪ Proportion of pupils with disabilities and OVCs starting grade 1 who complete primary and secondary education</li> </ul>
<b>ADDITIONAL TARGET: Double adult literacy rate by 2015</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Percentage of older persons who access adult literacy services/programmes</li> </ul>
<b><i>Goal 5: Improve maternal health</i></b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Percentage of women with disabilities with access to prenatal and reproductive health services</li> </ul>
<b><i>Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases</i></b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ HIV prevalence amongst older persons/PWD and different age groups</li> <li>▪ Percentage of older carers of OVCs and PLHA receiving support in their role</li> <li>▪ Proportion of OVCs who receive free support</li> <li>▪ Percentage of older persons/PWD with access VCT services</li> <li>▪ Percentage of PLWHA with access to antiretroviral drugs by age and sex</li> </ul>

<b>Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Proportion of the population with disabilities/older population with sustainable access to improved water source, urban and rural</li> <li>▪ Proportion of the population with disabilities/older population with access to improved sanitation, urban and rural</li> </ul>
<b>ADDITIONAL TARGET:</b> Increase accessibility to public infrastructure for people with disabilities	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Proportion of public services with adequate access for people with disabilities</li> </ul>
<b>MDG 8: Develop a global partnership for development</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Proportion of donor funds allocated to disability, older persons and OVCs.</li> </ul>

Note: PWD = persons with disabilities.

### Recommendations

- Persons with disabilities need visibility and it is important that there is a goal on persons with disability in the MDG framework.
- HIV/AIDS prevention has to be reflected in the MDGs – in particular proportion with access to VCT by age, sex and social group.

### 3.4 Promotion of health equity, sexual and reproductive health in the MDGs

#### Key issues

- High inequities in access to health services between rural and urban areas are evident in many countries
- Poor access to health services by the poor
- Low contraception use, unsafe abortions, low uptake of ante-natal, natal and post-natal services, high incidence of fistula in some countries, early marriages, unattended obstetric emergencies all lead to high maternal mortality
- High prevalence of malaria

#### Suggested indicators

Sex disaggregated data is required for monitoring progress, though other demand-side factors should also be considered. Participants agreed that all existing MDG indicators need to be disaggregated based on gender, age, locality (rural-urban), type of household, and social groups. The suggested supplementary indicators are shown in table 3.4.

**Table 3.4 Supplementary indicators to promote health equity in Africa**

<b>Goal 4: Reduce child mortality</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mortality rate of new neo nates (0-30 days)</li> <li>• Proportion of children completely vaccinated</li> <li>• Proportion of children who sleep under mosquito nets</li> <li>• Proportion of children receiving treatment in health centres</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Proportion of children affected by malaria receiving treatment</li> <li>• Child mortality rate due to malaria</li> <li>• Child mortality rate due to TB</li> <li>• Proportion of children with diarrhoea who receive treatment in a health facility</li> <li>• Proportion of children with diarrhoea who are treated with oral rehydration salts (ORS) at home</li> </ul>
<b>Goal 5: Improve maternal health</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Proportion of adolescents who have access to sexual and reproductive health services, by sex</li> <li>• Proportion of pregnant teenage adolescents</li> <li>• Proportion of pregnant women who sleep under bed nets</li> <li>• Proportion of reproductive age women with access to pre-natal and natal services</li> <li>• Proportion of women with access to home-based care, by age</li> <li>• Proportion of women with access to community outreach services, by age</li> </ul>
<b>Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Proportion of people affected by HIV/AIDS who are working</li> <li>• Access to ART disaggregated by sex</li> </ul>

### Recommendations

- New goal to monitor resource allocation to health as suggested in the draft report stressing the percentage of funding reaching sub-national levels.
- A lot of emphasis is on expansion of health facilities, there is need to find ways of monitoring outreach of health services and home-based care for all socially excluded groups.

## 4 Challenges and opportunities in implementing the suggested supplementary indicators

### Challenges

- Lack of disaggregated data – by sex, by social group and by age
- Unavailability of data for measuring the new indicators
- Cost and capacity constraints to collection of new data
- For some thematic groups there is no data that is systematically collected to form the baseline eg. Disability, nomadic populations.
- There exists a gap between the generators of statistics and the users – important to close the gap.

### Opportunities

- The existing data can be used; for example data being collected by sex and age for VCT and ART can be used; Some data is available in the primary and unpublished form – there is need to process and publish the data.
- 2010 and 2011 round of population censuses

- Adding specific questions to DHS, national household surveys

**Recommendations**

- Need to strengthen national statistical systems.
- Government commitment on resource allocation for statistics needs to be strengthened.
- Coordination between NSOs and line ministries need strengthening.
- Address the gap between the generators of statistics and users by encouraging frequent communication.
- Promote wide dissemination of statistics to all users including through networks.